A Proposal for a form of Proportional Representation

by

D.J.Huntley   and   M.Zuckermann
7341 Ridge Drive   220 W.15th St.
Burnaby, B.C.   North Vancouver, B.C.
V5A 1B4   V7M 1S2
604-299-9237   604-986-4011
huntley@sfu.ca   martinz@sfu.ca

July 31, 2004

Procedure:
1) Elections would be conducted in essentially the same manner as at present.
2) The candidate with the most votes in each riding becomes the member for that riding.
3) Additional members are declared elected according to the following scheme which is designed to produce proportional representation.
4) For each party with 3% or more of the vote, the number of members declared elected thus far is divided by the fraction of the vote that that party received.
5) The largest of these numbers is then multiplied by the fraction of the vote received for each party, and rounded to the nearest integer. These numbers are taken as the total number of members that the various parties should receive.
6) This will result in additional members needed for some parties, but no reductions. For each party these additional members will be those candidates for that party not so far elected and with the highest absolute number of votes. These will be members at large and are not expected to represent any particular riding.

Advantages of this system are:
·   A much fairer, proportional representation is achieved
·   There is no change to the current voting system
·   All members are elected by vote (ie no party list is used)
·   The additional members are likely to come from ridings with the largest number of actual voters.

Disadvantage:
·   An increase in the number of members which is non known in advance, and has the potential to be large. One might wish to put a limit on the total number. This limit could be accomplished by raising the above figure of 3% until this limit is attained.

Example:
An example is provided on the following pages. The numbers are from the 2004 federal election for the City of Vancouver and suburbs (17 seats). The votes for the minor parties have been omitted for clarity.
Note that the outcome using this scheme is significantly different from the actual results and is much a much fairer representation of the voters wishes. To summarize:

	Con	Lib	NDP	Green	NA	total
fraction of votes	0.309	0.349	0.267	0.055	0.019	1.000
actual number of seats	7	6	3	0	1	17
proposed number of members	7	8	6	1	1	23

Note, in the actual election:
·   The Liberals received a larger fraction of the popular vote than the Conservatives, but got fewer seats.
·   The NDP received 86% of the votes the Conservatives received, but less than half the number of seats

·   The Green party received 5.5% of the vote; on a proportion basis they should have received 1 seat, but got none.
All these 'errors' are corrected in the proposed system.

EXAMPLE

			Con	Lib	NDP	Green	NA

Burnaby Douglas

Candidate	Party	Votes		Con	Lib	NDP	Green	NA
Bill Cunningham	Lib	14748			14748			
George Drazenovic	Con	12531		12531				
Shawn Hunsdale	Green	1687					1687	
Bill Siksay	NDP	15682	X			15682		
Total number	votes	45343						

Burnaby-New West

Candidate	Party	Votes		Con	Lib	NDP	Green	NA
Peter Julian	NDP	14061	X			14061		
Revel Kunz	Green	1606					1606	
Mary Pynenburg	Lib	13732			13732			
Mike Redmond	Con	11821		11821				
Total number	votes	41698						

Delta

Candidate	Party	Votes		Con	Lib	NDP	Green	NA
John Cummins	Con	21308	X	21308				
Shelley Leonhardt	Lib	15515			15515			
Dana Miller	Green	3066					3066	
Itrath Syed	NDP	6838				6838		
Total number	votes	46727						

Dewdney

Candidate	Party	Votes		Con	Lib	NDP	Green	NA
Mike Bocking	NDP	15693				15693		
Blanche Juneau	Lib	10500			10500			
Randy Kamp	Con	18490	X	18490				
Tammy Meyer	Green	2535					2535	
Total number	votes	48016						

Fleetwood-Port Kells

Candidate	Party	Votes		Con	Lib	NDP	Green	NA
Barry Bell	NDP	10976				10976		
Gulzar Cheema	Lib	11568			11568			
Nina Grewal	Con	14052	X	14052				
David Walters	Green	2484					2484	
Total number	votes	39247						

New West-Coquitlam

Candidate	Party	Votes		Con	Lib	NDP	Green	NA
Paul Forseth	Con	15684	X	15684				
Dave Haggard	Lib	13073			13073			
Steve McClurg	NDP	15570				15570		
Carli Travers	Green	2683					2683	
Total number	votes	47710						

North Van

Candidate	Party	Votes	X	Con	Lib	NDP	Green	NA
Don Bell	Lib	22619	X		22619			
John Nelson	NDP	8967				8967		
Peggy Stortz	Green	4114					4114	
Ted White	Con	20548		20548				
Total number votes		56506						

Port Moody

Candidate	Party	Votes	X	Con	Lib	NDP	Green	NA
Charley King	NDP	12023				12023		
James Moore	Con	18664	X	18664				
Kwangyul Peck	Lib	12445			12445			
Richard Voigt	Green	1971					1971	
Total number votes		45584						

Richmond

Candidate	Party	Votes	X	Con	Lib	NDP	Green	NA
Raymond Chan	Lib	18204	X		18204			
Dale Jackaman	NDP	6142				6142		
Stephen Kronstein	Green	1743					1743	
Alice Wong	Con	14457		14457				
Total number votes		40922						

Surrey North

Candidate	Party	Votes	X	Con	Lib	NDP	Green	NA
Sunny Athwal	Green	658					658	
Chuck Cadman	NA	15089	X					15089
Jasbir Cheema	Con	4340		4340				
Jim Karpoff	NDP	8312				8312		
Dan Sheel	Lib	5413			5413			
Total number votes		34450						

Surrey South

Candidate	Party	Votes	X	Con	Lib	NDP	Green	NA
Romeo De-La-Pena	Green	3032					3032	
Russ Hiebert	Con	22760	X	22760				
Judy Higginbotham	Lib	19611			19611			
Pummy Kaur	NDP	7663				7663		
Total number votes		53338						

Van Centre

Candidate	Party	Votes	X	Con	Lib	NDP	Green	NA
Hedy Fry	Lib	21280	X		21280			
Robbie Mattu	Green	3580					3580	
Gary Mitchell	Con	10139		10139				
Kennedy Stewart	NDP	17050				17050		
Total number votes		52793						

Van East
Shirley Chan	Lib	10768		10768
Libby Davies	NDP	23452	X		23452
Harvey Grigg	Con	4153	4153
Ron Plowright	Green	2365			2365
Total number	votes	41534

Van Kingsway
David Emerson	Lib	17267	X	17267
Jesse Johl	Con	7037	7037
Tracey Mann	Green	1521			1521
Ian Waddell	NDP	15916		15916
Total number	votes	42697

Van Quadra
David Askew	NDP	8348		8348
Stephen Owen	Lib	29187	X	29187
Stephen Rogers	Con	14648	14648
Doug Warkentin	Green	3118			3118
Total number	votes	55665

Van South
Ujjal Dosanjh	Lib	18196	X	18196
Bev Meslo	NDP	10038		10038
Doug Perry	Green	1465			1465
Victor Chan	Con	10426	10426
Total number	votes	40876

West Van
Andrea Goldsmith	Green	5887			5887
John Reynolds	Con	21372	X	21372
Nicholas Simons	NDP	13156		13156
Blair Wilson	Lib	19685	19685
Total number	votes	60544

	Con	Lib	NDP	Green	NA	total
Total party votes	242430	273811	209887	43515	15089	784732
fraction of votes	0.309	0.349	0.267	0.055	0.019	1.000
number of seats if PR used	5	6	5	1	0.33	17
actual number of seats	7	6	3	0	1	17

actual # of seats/ fraction of votes   22.7   17.2   11.2   0.0   52.0

take largest of those with ≥3% of vote
  this is 22.7
Now apply this ratio to all parties
to calculate their number of members   7   8   6   1   0.44
This means we need 2 more Liberals, 3 more NDP and 1 Green.
These are selected from those candidates of these parties who had the highest number of votes but were not so far elected.

These are: <u>votes</u>
Lib   Blair Wilson   West Van   19685
      Judy Higginbotham Surrey S.   19611

NDP   Kennedy Stewart Van Centre   17050
      Ian Waddell   Van Kingsway   15916
      Mike Bocking   Dewdney   15693

Green   Andrea Goldsmith West Van   5887

and these would be the additional elected members - called members at large.